

SPECIAL REPORT

Are Abuse Shelters Helping the True Victims of Domestic Violence?



P.O. Box 1221
Rockville, MD 20849
www.saveservices.org

Victims of battering are among the most vulnerable in our society. Thanks to the courageous efforts of tenacious advocates, an estimated 1,200 domestic violence shelters are now located throughout the United States.¹ For victims of severe domestic violence, these shelters are considered a bulwark for protection and treatment.

Without a doubt these shelters have done much good. But three decades after the first shelters were established, we need to ask: “Are these programs reaching the persons who are most in need? Are they providing the necessary services? And are they effective in helping victims break the cycle of violence?” This Special Report sheds light on these questions.

This incident, which took place in the SafeSpace (Florida) shelter, reveals some facilities are being challenged to help the persons they were charged to assist:

On October 21, 2007, Milaus Almore was admitted to the SafeSpace abuse shelter. Ten days later, the 26-year-old woman lay dead, victimized by an attack that left a gaping knife wound in her neck. The perpetrator was Marilyn Hooks, another resident at the facility.²

An investigation into the death found basic management tools such as an organizational chart and clear supervisory duties were absent. The group concluded that Almore’s untimely death was caused by the “egregious failure of the entire agency to satisfactorily assure the health, safety, and welfare of both its clientele and staff.”³

This report is based on an extensive review of research articles and reports, analyses of federal tax returns, an analysis of over 75 shelter websites, and interviews with former employees and residents of abuse shelters. Information about the Economics of Abuse Shelters is found in Appendix A.

Background

What is the historical origin of abuse shelters, and what happens within the confines of the shelter walls?

Historical Background

The first abuse shelters were established in the United States in the 1970s.⁴ These programs were established, often at great personal sacrifice, to provide refuge, safety, and comfort to the victims of intimate partner violence.

Over time, many shelters began to shift their focus.

Psychologist David Fontes recounts the experience of the woman who founded W.E.A.V.E. (Women Escaping a Violent Environment), a Sacramento domestic violence shelter in the mid-1970s. “She told me that about two years after she started the shelter, she had to leave this place that she herself had founded,” Fontes explains. Why? Because

“radical feminists got on their board of directors and replaced her family system approach of treatment with a gender-feminist model.”⁵

The gender-feminist model views domestic violence as a consequence of sexism in patriarchal society.⁶ Research portrays a far more complex reality, however.⁷ For example, the U.S. Centers for Disease Control has compiled a listing of 29 risk factors for domestic violence.⁸ Only two of the factors relate to gender dominance variables.

Nonetheless, the gender-feminist ideology came to supplant the humanitarian and pragmatic focus of the early shelters. By 1988, a national survey found that 45% of shelters viewed their main role as promoting feminist political activism, while only 25% of shelters accorded first priority to providing treatment and support for victims of abuse.⁹

Services and Daily Routines

Shelters provide a broad range of services, including emergency housing, counseling, childcare, hotline, public outreach, and legal advocacy.¹⁰ Shelters are staffed both by paid employees and volunteers.

Upon arriving at the shelter, the client undergoes an intake assessment. In practice, the intake worker takes the person’s claims at face value and does not verify the allegations of abuse.

Daily routines are flexible. The resident may go to her place of employment, arrange for job interviews, or apply for welfare services. Or she may stay in the shelter, watching TV and socializing with other residents. Support groups are often available. Residents are generally allowed to come and go as they wish, although most shelters have curfew requirements.

Abuse shelters set a time limit for the stay—typically 1 to 2 months. After that time, the resident returns to the community. Less often she may qualify for transitional housing or be referred to another abuse shelter.

Needs of Shelter Residents

What are the needs of persons who reside in shelters? The answer to this question can be adduced from surveys of shelter residents, behavioral assessments, and administrative records.

Housing

Housing is the greatest need of most shelter residents, according to several surveys. Residential needs were cited by 84% of service providers in Hawaii,¹¹ 48% of respondents in San Diego,¹² and 17% of shelter residents in Florida.¹³ Not surprisingly, demand for shelter housing soars during periods of unemployment.¹⁴

Indeed, many social service agencies view abuse shelters and homeless facilities as meeting a similar need. In Kansas, many of the same programs cited in a statewide listing of *homeless* shelters¹⁵ are also listed as *abuse* shelters funded by the state's domestic violence coalition.¹⁶

Substance Abuse

Alcohol or drug abuse plays a role in about 40% of partner abuse cases, according to the U.S. Department of Justice.¹⁷ Not surprisingly, substance abuse has been documented to be a problem for many shelter residents. In California, "drugs and alcohol are involved in at least 50 to 60 percent of their domestic violence cases," according to a survey of shelter staff.¹⁸ In Hawaii, one in four shelter residents is referred for substance abuse services.¹⁹

Among women admitted to La Casa in Las Cruces, New Mexico:²⁰

- 39% admitted to engaging in illegal activities to get drugs during the previous year.
- 85% were using alcohol during the incident that triggered the woman's shelter admission.
- 14% had injured themselves or others as a result of drinking.

At the First Step shelter in Harrisonburg, Virginia, "Most of the other women were using the shelter as a halfway house," according to one resident.²¹

Interpersonal Aggression

Women are as likely as men to initiate partner violence.²² Many of these female aggressors end up in a shelter:

- A recent survey found 67% of women in shelters had committed one or more acts of severe partner violence in the previous year.²³
- At one Alabama shelter, one-fourth of the residents were currently engaged in stalking their partners.²⁴
- Erin Pizzey, founder of the first abuse shelter in the world, reports that among the first 100 women who came to her program, 62 were at least as violent as the partners that they were leaving.²⁵

Given these facts, it's not surprising that physical confrontations sometimes erupt. One woman revealed, "one night, a drug-addicted woman came into my room while I slept...She held a pocketknife to my throat and told me that if I didn't give her my phone card she'd slit my throat."²⁶

Childcare

Many women—74% of adult residents according to one survey²⁷—bring their children to the shelter. These women may face challenges in providing appropriate childcare.

A study found 35% of shelter residents had committed one or more acts of severe aggression against their children in the previous year.²⁸ In California, 17% of residents had a case open with Child and Protective Services.²⁹ In Florida, 15% of shelter residents cited needs with childcare, making it the second leading priority.³⁰

Effective parenting skills may also be a concern. One former shelter worker lamented the problem of mothers who return to the shelter "so intoxicated and drugged up that they can't properly care for their own children."³¹

In addition, shelters may fail to provide adequate supervision and protection for children, as in the case of toddler Myliak Dale, tragically run over while playing in the parking lot at SafeSpace in Florida.³²

Medical Care for Violence-Related Injuries

Shelters often affirm their mission is to assist "battered" women, referring to persons who have been beaten and injured by their intimate partners. But none of the needs assessments reviewed in preparing this Special Report identified medical attention for violence-related injuries as a leading concern. Indeed, the need for medical care consistently falls at or near the bottom of the priority list:

1. In Florida, a series of focus groups assessed the needs of persons residing at abuse shelters around the state.³³ Medical/health needs were mentioned only 9% of the time, with lack of low-cost dental care being the most salient medical need.
2. In the San Diego area, a survey of 599 women and counselors from six abuse shelters identified client needs at the time of intake. Only 10% of persons identified a need for medical services, ranking it as the lowest priority.³⁴
3. In Hawaii, only 8% of persons seen by shelter service providers required emergency medical attention³⁵—and emergency care may have included non-abuse related problems.

So what percentage of shelter residents are victims of battering? Accounts suggest the majority of residents were not admitted to the shelter as a result of domestic violence:

SAVE: STOP ABUSIVE AND VIOLENT ENVIRONMENTS

- The former director of a New Jersey shelter explained, “Only about 1 in 10 women had experienced any kind of physical injury.”³⁶
- A former worker at an abuse shelter in Lubbock, TX revealed, “an estimated 80%-90% of the ‘victims’ there are not victims.”³⁷
- “Truth be told here the shelter does not really serve primarily victims of domestic violence. These are drug addicted and alcoholic women that use the cover of domestic violence for free services,” according to a local government employee, referring to the Naples (Fla.) Shelter for Abused Women and Children.³⁸
- At the First Step shelter in Harrisonburg, Virginia, a former resident revealed, “I soon discovered that I was the only woman there for protection purposes.”

These surveys and reports suggest that being a victim of severe physical domestic violence is the cause of admission for about one in 10 shelter residents.

Recommendations for Improvement

Twelve broad concerns have been expressed about shelter operations. These concerns, along with recommendations for improvement, are described here:

1. Staff Training and Qualifications

Victims of domestic violence face serious social, psychological, and other problems. These persons require the help of a trained professional. But shelter staff members often lack requisite qualifications. A summary of needs assessments from 13 states around the country revealed “the need for more well-trained” shelter staff.³⁹ For example:

- Some shelters do not run background checks on job applicants, allowing persons with drug histories or violent criminal records to become shelter employees.⁴⁰ At AWARE in Jackson, Mich., a client advocate admitted to maintain a drug house, and one month later a shelter manager was found guilty of threatening her husband with a hammer.⁴¹
- Shelters are not staffed by appropriately qualified mental health professionals. For example, the websites of over 75 shelters were reviewed in researching this report. Not a single shelter stated it had a Certified Addictions Counselor or Licensed Alcohol and Drug Abuse Counselor on staff.

A job announcement from the Dunn House in Oregon illustrates the concern. The advertisement states staff must be able to provide crisis intervention (which requires a high level of mental health expertise) but lists only the following qualifications: The applicant must have a good driving record, pass a criminal check, and possess an understanding of “domestic violence, oppression, and related issues”—adding prior experience with persons in crisis would also be “helpful.”⁴² The position did not require the applicant to possess any academic degrees, training, or proven expertise in crisis counseling.

Recommendations: Shelter managers need to assure that qualified staff are available to residents, including staff with expertise in alcohol and drug abuse. Managers need to screen staff applicants for criminal records. A Master's-level mental health professional should be available for crisis counseling. Managers need to assure that volunteers are adequately trained to do tasks assigned to them.

2. *Admission Procedures*

The principal reason why shelters are filled with persons who have suffered no physical injury is because many intake workers, instructed to “always believe the victim,” do not require hard evidence of violence. These are examples of such policies:

- In California, shelters “have few criteria that prohibit a client from being admitted.”⁴³
- In Indiana, “We don’t really refuse anyone service,” according to the client services director of St. Jude House.⁴⁴
- At SafeSpace in Florida, “We don’t put up any more barriers for victims wanting to enter the shelter.”⁴⁵
- The YWCA Crisis Center in Enid, Oklahoma states on its website, “We do NOT require proof of abuse.”⁴⁶
- At a Lubbock, Texas shelter, “The ‘victims’ call the hotline to get into the shelter. When asked what the abuse was and when, they say ‘None.’ So the worker tells her that she will not qualify to come in. The caller then says, ‘Oh, my boyfriend hit me,’ and that gets her in!!,” reveals a former shelter worker.⁴⁷

Recommendations: Shelter managers need to establish policies that require persons requesting service to present objective proof of violence. Acceptable forms of evidence include visible injuries, photographic evidence, police reports, or medical records.

3. *Inclusiveness*

By law, persons cannot be excluded from participation in or be denied the benefits of any program receiving federal assistance.^{48,49} The Violence Against Women Act likewise states that male victims qualify for VAWA-funded services.⁵⁰

But sex discrimination continues to be commonplace.⁵¹ Mission statements announce their intention to help women and children, with no mention of assisting men. Shelter websites do not employ gender-neutral or gender-inclusive terminology.

Judy King Smith, director of the Rape and Domestic Violence Information Center in Morgantown, West Virginia, once admitted, “We do not shelter men in the shelter even if it’s empty.” Why? For the stated reason that “we were founded for the purpose of providing shelter to battered women and their children.”⁵²

Many shelters refuse to admit male adolescent children, forcing victims to become separated from their loved ones. Such policies are now beginning to change.⁵³

In 2005, a lawsuit was filed against the state of California for unlawful denial of services against male victims. The Third District Court of Appeal in Sacramento later ruled such practices violate constitutional equal protection guarantees.⁵⁴

One survey highlighted the exclusionary practices of domestic violence shelters toward lesbian and gay victims, concluding these persons “still did not have consistent access to culturally competent services to prevent and address the violence against them.”⁵⁵

Recommendations: Shelter staff should embrace the ideal of inclusiveness and obey federal and state laws that forbid discrimination on the basis of race, gender, or sexual identity.

4. *Families*

Many shelter residents wish to continue the relationship with their partner at some level. But some shelters mandate that clients terminate all contact with their partners, regardless of the client’s wishes:

- Safehorizon in New York City openly states that clients may be “forced to sever relationships with family and friends.”⁵⁶
- “The only solution championed by the shelter was to get free from that big, malicious male,” reveals a judge who served on the advisory committee of a Seattle-area shelter.⁵⁷

Demanding that a woman stop seeing her partner is not only unrealistic, it also runs afoul of the ethical principle that counselors must “respect the rights of clients to make decisions.”⁵⁸

Recommendations: Shelters need to respect client autonomy and decision-making. Shelters should never mandate dissolution of a relationship as a condition of service.

5. *Counseling Services*

Counseling services are a mainstay of shelter offerings. But cases have been reported that question the quality of such services:

- A former support group member found that the real message was to “accept the indoctrination and embrace my victimhood...I realized that I never heard a facilitator encourage a woman to heal and move on with her life.”⁵⁹
- At Bethany House in Virginia, staff would “infuriate the woman with propaganda, and then exploit the wife’s frustration and anger as retaliation against the husband,” according to a former staffer.⁶⁰

And there is a growing awareness of the existence of female-initiated and mutual abuse. In one study, researchers found that half of all cases of domestic violence are two-way,

and of the non-mutual cases, 70% are female-perpetrated.⁶¹ But abuse shelters seldom provide counseling services to address female aggression.

One researcher reported receiving letters from violence-prone women who were “turned away or being offered no help when they called a crisis line or shelter.”⁶² Or if shelters do offer services for aggressive women, they may portray female offenders as the *victims*.⁶³

Recommendations: Shelter managers need to assure that counseling services promote healing and recovery. Shelters need to offer anger management classes for women and services for persons involved in mutual partner abuse.

6. *False Allegations*

Inducing a person to make a false allegation—referred to by lawyers as “suborning perjury”—is against the law. But some shelters have been reported to engage in the practice.

At SafeNet in Claremore, Oklahoma, employees induced a psychiatrically ill woman to file domestic violence charges against her husband. The judge later ruled, “The claims of Crystal Hall as to abuse appear to the Court to have been manufactured or fabricated.”⁶⁴

At Bethany House in Virginia, “Women with almost no marital problems are declared abused and are coached by the staff to go to court and get a protective order against their husbands,” reveals a former shelter volunteer.⁶⁵

The Shield Foundation in Phoenix, Arizona, reportedly encourages women to file an order of protection and then induces the men “into breaking the Orders, getting them arrested.”⁶⁶ While a man languishes in jail, his house is ransacked for jewelry, electronic equipment, and other goods to be sold on the black market.

Recommendations: Shelter staff must not encourage or “coach” residents to embellish on allegations of abuse.

7. *Documentation and Reporting of Incidents*

Shelter policies generally require that incidents involving residents be documented. But staff do not always abide by these policies. At SafeSpace in Florida, an investigation into the fatal stabbing of a resident revealed there had been no documentation of the repeated death threats by the perpetrator, another woman residing in the shelter at the time.⁶⁷

By law, shelter staff is required to report child abuse. At Another Way in Florida, a 5-year-old was sexually assaulted by an older girl. Shelter staff failed to promptly report the incident to law enforcement, despite requests by the mother.⁶⁸

Why did such incidents often go unreported? According to a former employee, the staff had been instructed to not document such incidents in order to forestall any consequences in case the “Department of Children and Families (DCF) or a father wants to have the records subpoenaed.”⁶⁹

Recommendations: Shelters need to enforce policies regarding the documentation and reporting of incidents, including cases of child abuse and neglect.

8. Abuse and Harassment

Abusive treatment of residents, and in some cases of staff, is a worrisome problem. According to a 2008 survey of residents in 215 shelters, “The most common problem encountered by the respondents in this study was conflict with other residents in the shelter (32%).”⁷⁰

A number of cases illustrate the concern:

- At the White Buffalo Calf Society shelter in South Dakota, the Rosebud tribal council voted to suspend all funding for the shelter based on “alleged verbal and mental abuse to women and children.”⁷¹
- At the Spring shelter in Tampa, Fla., director Joanne Lighter was accused of repeatedly abusing shelter staff, triggering staff resignations, terminations, and even death-threats.⁷²
- At the SafePlace in Portsmouth, NH, several incidents of abusive behavior by staff were reported.⁷³
- At a record release party, Grammy Award winner Mary Blige, founder of the Mary Bilge Domestic Violence Shelter, screamed at her husband and hit him in the face, drawing blood.⁷⁴

At Bethany House in Virginia, an incident of sexual harassment was reported in which “Ms. Veronica and Ms. Liang were let go as house managers because of misconduct, misappropriation of Bethany House funds, and complaints of inappropriate sexual advances against the shelter residents.”⁷⁵

Recommendation: Shelter managers need to establish and enforce anti-harassment policies designed to protect residents and staff.

9. Complaint Procedures

Shelter residents face severe pressures in their personal lives and may experience difficulties in their relationships with shelter staff and other residents. Sometimes residents file a grievance. Reports have been made of shelter staff taking retaliatory measures against residents who filed such complaints:

- Christina Wilson made a complaint about the Cherokee (Georgia) Family Violence Center. As a consequence, she was discharged from the facility.⁷⁶

- At Womenscare in Bellingham, Washington, shelter staff exposed a resident's newly changed name in retaliation for a complaint she filed with the state human rights council.⁷⁷
- In Massachusetts, one mother charged that clients in shelter-run groups were coerced by use of "threats, intimidation, and fear of losing their children." In the end, she filed a lawsuit alleging a variety of civil rights violations.⁷⁸

Recommendations: Shelter managers should establish procedures for the filing and resolution of complaints. Shelter staff should not engage in retaliatory practices.

10. Law Enforcement

Most abuse shelters enjoy good working relationships with local law enforcement officials. But these relationships can become strained when shelter staff cite confidentiality restrictions that preclude law enforcement personnel from doing their jobs.

In one case, a 12-year-old boy was allegedly raped by a shelter resident at a Tucson, Arizona, center. But staff barred police from interviewing the suspected perpetrator under the pretext that doing so would violate the center's confidentiality agreement with its residents.⁷⁹

Some police departments release a jailed woman to a local shelter with the understanding that she is being placed under house arrest. But shelter staff have allowed the offender to come and go as she wishes, ignoring curfew requirements: "Women on house arrest were breaking their 5:00 p.m. curfews by leaving at 5:30 p.m. and not returning until 6:00 a.m. But 'shush'—you can't tell their probation officers because that would 'breach their confidentiality,'" reveals one former worker.⁸⁰

Recommendations: Shelter workers need to cooperate with requests of law enforcement personnel. Staff should not cite confidentiality concerns as a means to avoid compliance with police requests.

11. Programmatic Accountability

Abuse survivor Emi Koyama has catalogued a variety of problems at abuse shelters, attributing the deficiencies to the fact that there are "little or no institutional mechanisms to hold service providers accountable to the actual needs and perspectives of people receiving services."⁸¹

For the potential shelter resident, obtaining even basic information about shelter services often presents a challenge. Many shelters have no website, and even when they do, staff listings, services, and utilization reports are seldom posted. Performance objectives may be absent altogether, or consist of measures of questionable validity such as "65% or more of survivors who are provided services will have knowledge of community services."⁸²

Many states have no regulations governing shelter operations. Or if they do, the standards may be optional, as in Arkansas,⁸³ or administered by the state domestic violence council, which amounts to little more than self-regulation.⁸⁴

Recommendations: Shelters should work to establish and adhere to professional and good-practice standards. Shelters need to publish on their websites annual reports that detail services provided, client demographics, and performance on outcome measures.

12. Financial Accountability

Some shelters allocate funds for questionable purposes. In Florida, the Shelter for Abused Women and Children offers a beauty salon, promising women will now be “pampered in a safe and convenient location.”⁸⁵ One shelter visitor was shocked to see “The shelter was full of unopened toys, bikes, and expensive furniture donations.”⁸⁶ Some shelters tout their pet-care facilities.⁸⁷

Embezzlement of funds has been a vexing problem in some places:

- Denorvas Stevenson, former director of Project Safe in Shawnee, Oklahoma, was charged with eight counts of embezzlement after an audit revealed more than \$56,000 in undocumented and unauthorized expenses.⁸⁸
- Paulette Vang, former treasurer of Asian Women United of Minnesota, admitted to stealing \$200,000 from the group to use for gambling.⁸⁹
- Cindy Lou Shores, former head of the South Central Region Tribal Nations and Friends Domestic Violence Coalition in Oklahoma, was sentenced to 17 months in federal prison and ordered to pay \$170,000 in restitution.⁹⁰
- In 2008, the director of Domestic Violence Emergency Services in Roanoke, Virginia, was sentenced to a year in jail for stealing shelter funds.⁹¹
- Store manager Joyce Cotton was arrested for allegedly stealing \$11,000 from the Pizazz Thrift Shop operated by the Harbor shelter in Clayton, NC.⁹²

Four cases of outright fraud have been reported:

- In California, the Community Fellowship for Battered Women opened a shelter subsidized by the proceeds from donated, used cars. In 2002, the Fellowship took in \$186,000, but only 5% of that amount was used to actually help victims of domestic violence.⁹³ The IRS later revoked the group’s tax-exempt status.⁹⁴
- In Missouri, the Battered Mothers Resource Fund solicited funds to establish a Mother’s Assistance Fund, community outreach seminars, and other services. But none of the advertised services were ever provided, prompting the state attorney general to shut down the program.⁹⁵
- In Ohio, the FBI staged a raid on the headquarters of the Southern Christian Leadership Conference, following an investigation by the Dayton Daily News that the group was receiving funding for an abuse shelter it no longer operated.⁹⁶

Recommendations: Shelters need to follow good accounting practices. Shelters should publish annual financial reports on their websites. Government officials need to be on the look-out for fraudulent practices.

W.E.A.V.E. – Wave of the Future?

This Special Report recounts the needs of shelter residents, highlights the current challenges facing shelters, and provides recommendations for enhanced program effectiveness.

At the beginning, this Special Report described the experience of a northern California shelter known as W.E.A.V.E., Women Escaping a Violent Environment. W.E.A.V.E. was originally established to provide help to persons in need. Then W.E.A.V.E. came under a gender-feminist model. Nearly 30 years later, that same shelter was one of the programs forced to defend itself in a sex discrimination lawsuit, described on page 11 of this report.

Now, W.E.A.V.E. is coming full circle, moving away from its history of discrimination. “All agencies like WEAVE grew out of the women’s movement,” explains WEAVE Executive Director Beth Hassett. But now, “I know that there are men out there who need help... We’re serving children, we’re serving men. We’re serving victims of all sorts that don’t fit into the mold.”⁹⁷

Now the organization’s website uses gender-inclusive terminology and announces, “Services are available to anyone who needs them, regardless of gender, race, age, religion, sexual orientation, or income level.”

W.E.A.V.E. is not the only abuse shelter that prides itself on offering an inclusive, therapeutic environment for survivors of abuse. The Antelope Valley (California) Domestic Violence Council established the first co-ed shelter in the country and employs staff members of both sexes.⁹⁸ Shelter director Carol Crabson explains, “Nobody deserves to get hit, whether they are 2 months old or 80 years old, whether they are a man or woman, child or teen.”⁹⁹ “To my knowledge the female residents never had a problem with this practice,” reveals the former shelter director.¹⁰⁰

Other commendable programs around the country include:

- South Lake Tahoe Women’s Center, Nevada¹⁰¹
- The Bridge in Fostoria, Ohio that provides services for male victims;¹⁰²
- Caring Place, Indiana¹⁰³
- Domestic Abuse Shelter Homes of Florida that offers a “Women Who Batter Intervention Program”¹⁰⁴
- Johnnie’s Place, Atlanta, Georgia¹⁰⁵
- Women’s Rape and Crisis Center, Burlington, Vermont, which reports 14% of its clients are male¹⁰⁶

SAVE: STOP ABUSIVE AND VIOLENT ENVIRONMENTS

The list of model shelters continues to grow.¹⁰⁷ Recognition is also due to the New Hampshire Coalition against Domestic and Sexual Violence, which commissioned a survey on male victimization in that state.¹⁰⁸

As we enter the second decade of the 21st century, shelters are facing an identity crisis: Are shelters primarily way-stations for the homeless? Halfway houses for the substance-addicted? Childcare facilities? Or are they sanctuaries designed to help the abused struggling to start a new life?

Victims desperately need our help, and abuse shelters are an indispensable resource to our communities. We must help shelters refocus on the singular challenge of helping the true victims of domestic violence overcome the cycle of abuse.

Economics of Abuse Shelters

Based on federal tax reports, the average shelter income and salary of executive directors at 115 shelters in five geographically-diverse states is shown below:¹⁰⁹

Region	State	Number of Shelters	Average Total Income*	Average Salary of Executive Director†
Midwest	Indiana	24	\$741,125	\$43,958
Northeast	Connecticut	14	\$1,619,714	\$80,846
Northwest	Oregon	25	\$597,640	\$42,880
Southeast	Florida	32	\$1,965,109	\$65,063
Southwest	Colorado	20	\$811,950	\$50,263
Average			\$1,169,796	\$55,000

The bottom row shows each shelter's average annual income approaches \$1.2 million. Extrapolating to all 1,200 shelters around the country, an estimated \$1.4 billion is allocated to abuse shelters each year.‡ These monies come from awards by federal and state governments, as well as from charitable organizations and private contributions.

The table shows the average salary of shelter directors is \$55,000. But some directors enjoy substantially higher compensation and benefits packages:¹¹⁰

- Paige Flink, Family Place, Dallas, Texas: \$163,176
- Kristine Hazzard, Center for Women and Families, Bridgeport, Connecticut: \$102,604
- Christel Nichols, House of Ruth, Washington, DC: \$157,743

Shelters are reimbursed on a monthly basis for the number of units of service provided, such as shelter admissions, case management, counseling, and safety plans.¹¹¹ In Florida, shelters are reimbursed the following amounts:¹¹²

- Restraining order: \$390¹¹³
- Regional Youth Leadership Training: \$750¹¹⁴
- Statewide Primary Prevention Institute: \$750
- Curriculum Draft: \$2,000
- Curriculum Final: \$1,000
- Primary Prevention Programming with Youth: \$5,000

* IRS Form 990, Line L

† IRS Form 990, Part V-A, Column C

‡ \$1,169,796 x 1,200 shelters = \$1,403,755,200

References

- ¹ Pennell S, Burke C, Mulmat DH. Violence Against Women in San Diego. San Diego: SANDAG, 2000, p. 32. <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/191838.pdf>
- ² Winslow MV, Young C. Suspect in SafeSpace stabbing in Martin County claims self-defense. *TC Palm*, November 14, 2007. <http://www.tcpalm.com/news/2007/nov/14/30suspect-in-safespace-stabbing-claims-self/>
- ³ Howk A. Report: SafeSpace shelter in Stuart had ‘egregious failure.’ *TC Palm*. November 10, 2007. <http://m.tcpalm.com/news/2007/Nov/10/30report-safespace-had-egregious-failure/>
- ⁴ Rosewater L and Walker LE. *Handbook of Feminist Therapy*. New York: Spring Publishing, 1985.
- ⁵ Fontes D. Male victims of domestic violence. In Hamel J and Nichols TL (eds.). *Family Interventions in Domestic Violence: A Handbook of Gender-Inclusive Theory and Treatment*. New York: Spring Publishing Co., 2007, p. 312.
- ⁶ Dobash RE, Dobash R. *Violence against Wives*. New York: The Free Press, 1979.
- ⁷ Straus MA, Scott K. Gender symmetry in partner violence. In Lutzker JR, Whitaker DJ (eds.): *Prevention of Partner Violence*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association, 2009.
- ⁸ Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Intimate partner violence: Risk and protective factors. October 21, 2008. <http://www.cdc.gov/ViolencePrevention/intimatepartnerviolence/riskprotectivefactors.html>
- ⁹ Epstein S, Russell G, and Silvern L. Structure and ideology of shelters for battered women. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, Vol. 16, 1988, pp. 345–367.
- ¹⁰ Florida Coalition Against Domestic Violence. Deliverables July 1, 2008 – June 30, 2009. <http://www.fcadv.org/downloads/quality/Exhibit%20A%20Deliverables.pdf>
- ¹¹ State of Hawaii, Department of Social Services. FY 2008 Family Violence Prevention and Services Act Grant Application. February 2008, p.10. http://hawaii.gov/dhs/protection/social_services/child_welfare/FY2008%20FVPSA%20Appl%20wo%20certifications.pdf
- ¹² Pennell S, Burke C, Mulmat DH. Violence Against Women in San Diego. San Diego: SANDAG, 2000, Table 4.4. <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/191838.pdf>
- ¹³ Vinton L, Wilke D et al. Florida’s Domestic Violence Needs Assessment for 2006–2007. Tallahassee, FL: Florida State University. Undated. <http://www.def.state.fl.us/domesticviolence/publications/dvna0607final.pdf>
- ¹⁴ Cedars D. Women’s shelters blame stress. 7 News. January 12, 2009. <http://www.thedenverchannel.com/money/18467530/detail.html?rss=den&psp=news>
- ¹⁵ Kansas Housing Resources Corporation. Kansas homeless shelters and services. Accessed January 2, 2009. <http://www.kshousingcorp.org/display/files/ESG/KANSAS%20HOMELESS%20SHELTERS.pdf>
- ¹⁶ Kansas Coalition Against Domestic Violence. Kansas Resources. Accessed January 2, 2009. <http://www.kcsdv.org/ksresources.html>
- ¹⁷ Greenfeld LA. Alcohol and crime: An analysis of national data on the prevalence of alcohol involvement in crime. NCJ 168632. 1998. Figure 6.
- ¹⁸ Bugarin A. The prevalence of domestic violence in California. Sacramento: California Research Bureau, 2002, p. 12. <http://www.library.ca.gov/crb/02/16/02-016.pdf>
- ¹⁹ State of Hawaii, Department of Social Services. FY 2008 Family Violence Prevention and Services Act Grant Application. February 2008, p. 10. http://hawaii.gov/dhs/protection/social_services/child_welfare/FY2008%20FVPSA%20Appl%20wo%20certifications.pdf

²⁰ Krishnan SP, Hilbert JC, McNeil K. Understanding domestic violence in multi-ethnic rural communities: A focus on collaborations among the courts, the law enforcement agencies, and the shelters. New Mexico State University, 2002.

<http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/191863.pdf>

²¹ First Step shelter in Harrisonburg, Virginia proves more dangerous for woman than her home. Accessed November 28, 2008. <http://www.ejfi.org/DV/dv-53.htm>

²² Straus MA. Dominance and symmetry in partner violence by male and female university students in 32 nations. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 2008.

<http://pubpages.unh.edu/%7Eemas2/ID41-PR41-Dominance-symmetry-In-Press-07.pdf>

²³ McDonald R, Jouriles E., Tart C, Minze L. Children's adjustment problems in families characterized by men's severe violence toward women: Does other family violence matter? *Child Abuse & Neglect* Vol. 33, No. 2, 2009.

²⁴ Langhinrichsen-Rohling J. An examination of sheltered battered women's perpetration of stalking and other unwanted behaviors. *Violence and Victims*, Vol. 21, No. 5, 2006.

²⁵ Pizzey E. *Prone to Violence*. 1982. <http://www.bennett.com/ptv/>

²⁶ First Step shelter in Harrisonburg, Virginia, proves more dangerous for woman than her home. Accessed November 28, 2008. <http://www.ejfi.org/DV/dv-59.htm>

²⁷ Pennell S, Burke C, Mulmat DH. Violence Against Women in San Diego. San Diego: SANDAG, 2000, Table 4.4. <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/191838.pdf>

²⁸ McDonald R, Jouriles E., Tart C, Minze L. Children's adjustment problems in families characterized by men's severe violence toward women: Does other family violence matter? *Child Abuse & Neglect* Vol. 33, No. 2, 2009.

²⁹ Pennell S, Burke C, Mulmat DH. Violence Against Women in San Diego. San Diego: SANDAG, 2000. <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/191838.pdf>

³⁰ Vinton L, Wilke D et al. Florida's Domestic Violence Needs Assessment for 2006–2007. Tallahassee, FL: Florida State University. Undated.

<http://www.dcf.state.fl.us/domesticviolence/publications/dvna0607final.pdf>

³¹ McGowan A. Florida domestic violence centers called biased. *The Liberator*, Fall 2008, p. 4.

³² Panoff R. Report: Driver looked, but failed to see toddler in Stuart. *TC Palm*, October 26, 2007. <http://www.tcpalm.com/news/2007/oct/26/report-driver-looked-but-failed-to-see-toddler/>

³³ Vinton L, Wilke D et al. Florida's Domestic Violence Needs Assessment for 2006–2007. Tallahassee, FL: Florida State University. Undated.

<http://www.dcf.state.fl.us/domesticviolence/publications/dvna0607final.pdf>

³⁴ Pennell S, Burke C, Mulmat DH. Violence Against Women in San Diego. San Diego: SANDAG, 2000, Table 4.4. <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/191838.pdf>

³⁵ State of Hawaii, Department of Social Services. FY 2008 Family Violence Prevention and Services Act Grant Application, February 2008, p. 10.

http://hawaii.gov/dhs/protection/social_services/child_welfare/FY2008%20FVPSA%20App1%20wo%20certifications.pdf

³⁶ Former shelter director reveals why she left. March 10, 2007.

<http://www.mediaradar.org/shelterDirectorRevealsWhySheLeft.php>

³⁷ Former Shelter Worker Tells All: "80%-90% of the 'victims' there are not victims." *Men's News Daily*. May 27, 2010. <http://abusegate.mensnewsdaily.com/2010/05/27/former-shelter-worker-80-90-of-the-victims-there-are-not-victims/>

³⁸ Comment to Collier clerk's office donates items to abuse shelter. *Naples Daily News*. October 10, 2008. <http://www.naplesnews.com/news/2008/oct/10/collier-clerks-office-donates-items-abuse-shelter/>

³⁹ Vinton L, Wilke D et al. Florida's Domestic Violence Needs Assessment for 2006–2007. Tallahassee, FL: Florida State University. Undated.

<http://www.dcf.state.fl.us/domesticviolence/publications/dvna0607final.pdf>

⁴⁰ McGowan A. Florida domestic violence centers called biased. *The Liberator*, Fall 2008, p. 4.

⁴¹ Quisenberry D. Domestic violence program coordinator at AWARE Inc. found guilty of felonious assault for threatening husband with hammer. *Jackson Citizen*. May 18, 2010. http://www.mlive.com/news/jackson/index.ssf/2010/05/domestic_violence_coordinator.html

⁴² Community Works. Dunn House Shelter Staff, Relief. Accessed January 9, 2009. http://www.community-works.org/index.php?/cw/victim_services_postings/#

⁴³ Pennell S, Burke C, Mulmat DH. Violence Against Women in San Diego. San Diego: SANDAG, 2000, p. 41. <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/191838.pdf>

⁴⁴ Associated Press. Police: Shelter refused to accept tortured teen. October 3, 2003. http://fathersforlife.org/fv/women_shelter9.htm

⁴⁵ Howk A. SafeSpace shelter in Martin County releases plan to increase safety. *TCPalm*, November 16, 2007. <http://www.tcpalm.com/news/2007/nov/16/30safespace-plan-to-increase-safety/>

⁴⁶ <http://www.ywcaeid.com/ccemergencyshelter.html> . Accessed November 6, 2008.

⁴⁷ Former Shelter Worker Tells All: “80%-90% of the ‘victims’ there are not victims.” *Men’s News Daily*. May 27, 2010. <http://abusegate.mensnewsdaily.com/2010/05/27/former-shelter-worker-80-90-of-the-victims-there-are-not-victims/>

⁴⁸ Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972, 20 U.S.C. 1681, 1682, 1683, 1685, and 1686, cited in HHS Grants Policy Statement, January 1, 2007. http://www.hhs.gov/grantsnet/docs/HHSGPS_107.doc

⁴⁹ Omnibus Crime Control and Safe Streets Act of 1968, Section 3789d. (c)(1). <http://www.usdoj.gov/crt/split/42usc3789d.htm>

⁵⁰ Violence Against Women Act 2005, Section 40002(b)(8). http://frwebgate.access.gpo.gov/cgi-bin/getdoc.cgi?dbname=109_cong_public_laws&docid=f:publ162.109.pdf

⁵¹ Stop Abusive and Violent Environments. Domestic Violence Programs Discriminate Against Male Victims. Rockville, MD: 2010. <http://www.saveservices.org/downloads/VAWA-Discriminates-Against-Males>

⁵² Deposition of Judy King Smith, September 9, 2008, pp. 16, 18, and 72.

⁵³ Bartley N. Mason County shelter to be state’s first to allow victims’ teen sons, pets. *Seattle Times*, November 26, 2006. <http://community.seattletimes.nwsourc.com/archive/?date=20061126&slug=turningpointe25m>

⁵⁴ *Woods v. Shewry*; 3rd Dist. C056072 <http://www.courtinfo.ca.gov/cgi-bin/opinions.cgi>

⁵⁵ National Center for Victims of Crime and the National Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs. Why it Matters. 2010. <http://www.nvc.org/nvc/main.aspx?dbName=DocumentViewer&DocumentID=47632>

⁵⁶ Front door. Accessed January 2, 2009. http://www.safehorizon.org/page.php?nav=bd&page=sheltertour_door

⁵⁷ Brooks H. American feminists’ abuse industry. www.fathermag.com/205/abuse/

⁵⁸ American Association for Marriage and Family Therapy. AAMFT Code of Ethics. July 1, 2001. Principle 1.8. http://www.aamft.org/resources/LRM_Plan/Ethics/ethicscode2001.asp

⁵⁹ Moore N. Inside a batterers program for “abused” women. *Ifeminists.net*, July 29, 2003. <http://www.ifeminists.net/introduction/editorials/2003/0729moore.html>

⁶⁰ Bethany House Virginia – A one stop divorce shop. Posted May 22, 2004. http://www.safe4all.org/forums/message-view?message_id=31905

⁶¹ Whitaker DJ et al. Differences in frequency of violence and reported injury between relationships with reciprocal and nonreciprocal intimate partner violence. *American Journal of Public Health*, Vol. 97, No. 5, 2007.

⁶² Cook P. Abused Men: *The Hidden Side of Domestic Violence*, p. 110.

⁶³ Hamel J and Nichols TL (eds.). *Family Interventions in Domestic Violence: A Handbook of Gender-Inclusive Theory and Treatment*. New York: Spring Publishing Co., 2007, p. 316.

⁶⁴ Public Order dismissing juvenile action and determining child custody, support, and visitation. December 7, 2007. <http://www.donhaslam.com/cases/documents/Halffinalorder.PDF>

⁶⁵ Bethany House Virginia – A one stop divorce shop. Posted May 22, 2004. http://www.safe4all.org/forums/message-view?message_id=31905

⁶⁶ Arizona Center for Justice. Olga Chaikheeva – Art Smasch – Shield Foundation professional criminals masquerading under the flag of legitimacy. *Ripoff Report*, July 30, 2007. www.ripoffreport.com/reports/0/264/RipOff0264095.htm

⁶⁷ Florida Coalition Against Domestic Violence. Safespace, Inc. homicide incident: Management review. November 9, 2007. <http://web.tcpalm.com/2007/11/10/safespace.pdf>

⁶⁸ McGowan A. Florida domestic violence centers called biased. *The Liberator*, Fall 2008. p. 5.

⁶⁹ McGowan A. Florida domestic violence centers called biased. *The Liberator*, Fall 2008. p. 3.

⁷⁰ Lyon E, Lane S, Menard A. Meeting Survivors Needs: A Multi-State Study of Domestic Violence Shelter Experiences. 2008. Prepared for the National Institute of Justice. P. 13.

⁷¹ Garrigan M. Tribe freezes funding for domestic violence shelter. *Rapid City Journal* July 21, 2010. http://www.rapidcityjournal.com/news/article_6c6915a0-9508-11df-a4c5-001cc4c03286.html

⁷² Montgomery B. Inside Tampa domestic violence shelter, there's quite a storm. *St. Petersburg Times*. June 6, 2010. <http://www.tampabay.com/features/article1100401.ece>

⁷³ McCormick P. Woman complains about mistreatment in NH abuse shelter. *Men's New Daily* April 20, 2010. <http://abusegate.mensnewsdaily.com/category/abusegate/>

⁷⁴ Blige hauls off on husband. *New York Post*. December 24, 2009.

<http://showhype.com/video/mary-j-blige-punches-her-husband-caught-on-tape/>

⁷⁵ Abuse allegations involving Bethany House Social workers. Posted May 20, 2004. http://www.safe4all.org/forums/message-view?message_id=31905

⁷⁶ Communication with Christina Wilson, May 13, 2008.

⁷⁷ Communication with Desiree Carpenter, July 1, 2008.

⁷⁸ Moore N. Inside a 'batterers program' for 'abused' women. *Ifeminists.net*, July 29, 2003. <http://www.ifeminists.net/introduction/editorials/2003/0729moore.html>

⁷⁹ Huicochea A. Police: Woman, boy had sex at shelter. *Arizona Daily Star*, December 29, 2005. <http://www.azstarnet.com/metro/109042.php>

⁸⁰ McGowan A. Florida domestic violence centers called biased. *The Liberator*, Fall 2008, p. 3.

⁸¹ Koyama E. Abuse of survivors within the domestic violence shelter system. *Disloyal to Feminism*. Portland, OR: Confluere Publications, 2003. <http://eminism.org/readings/pdf-rdg/disloyal.pdf>

⁸² Florida Coalition Against Domestic Violence. FY08-09 Contract overview. June 9, 2008 Webinar. <https://cc.readytalk.com/play?id=8663ev68>

⁸³ Arkansas Council Against Domestic Violence. Shelters by city. Accessed August 7, 2008. <http://www.domesticpeace.com/members.html>

⁸⁴ Florida Coalition Against Domestic Violence. Contract monitoring. Accessed January 13, 2009. http://www.fcadv.org/quality-contract_monitoring.php

⁸⁵ Newsletter of the Florida Coalition against Domestic Violence. Vol. 5, No. 1, p. 6.

⁸⁶ Zabjek A. Domestic violence not a women's issue: educator. *Edmonton Journal*, September 8, 2008. Reader comment no. 1.

<http://www.canada.com/edmontonjournal/news/story.html?id=5c618479-1cce-4b3d-b04a-e5351059c9ec>

⁸⁷ American Humane Society. Pets and Women's Shelters. <http://www.americanhumane.org/homepage/featured-news/paws-program.html>. Accessed November 7, 2008.

⁸⁸ Hawk S. Murder, mayhem no stranger to year. *Shawnee (OK) News Star*, December 31, 1999. http://www.news-star.com/stories/123199/com_crime.shtml

-
- ⁸⁹ Theft alleged at abuse shelter. *Pioneer Press*, February 2006.
- ⁹⁰ Former nonprofit official sentenced. NewsOK.com. March 5, 2008. <http://newsok.com/article/3212136/more/headlines/weather>
- ⁹¹ Arkin S. Former DOVES director sentenced. *Danville News*, September 2, 2008. http://www.godanriver.com/gdr/news/local/danville_news/article/former_doves_director_sentenced/5953/
- ⁹² Gallaher R. Woman charged with embezzlement from thrift store. WNCT News. August 7, 2010. <http://www2.wnct.com/news/2010/aug/07/woman-charged-embezzlement-thrift-store-ar-326485/>
- ⁹³ Mountain View Voice. Buyer beware before donating cars. May 14, 2004. http://www.mv-voice.com/morgue/2004/2004_05_14.edit.shtml
- ⁹⁴ Internal Revenue Service. Deletions from cumulative list of organizations – Contributions which are deductible under Section 170 of the code. January 14, 2008, p. 269. http://www.irs.gov/pub/irs-tege/a2008_3.pdf
- ⁹⁵ Levitt A. Domestic violence center shut down for being a total fraud. *Riverfront Times*. July 29, 2010. http://blogs.riverfronttimes.com/dailyrft/2010/07/domestic_violence_center_shut_down_for_being_a_total_fraud.php
- ⁹⁶ Hulsey L, Beyerlein T. Local officials halt SCLC funding. *Dayton Daily News*. February 12, 2010. <http://www.daytondailynews.com/news/crime/local-officials-halt-sclc-funding-544487.html>
- ⁹⁷ Frampton W. WEAVE fights traditional images of domestic violence offering men help from abusers. News10/KXTV April 21, 2010. <http://domesticviolenceresourcesformen.blogspot.com/2010/04/weave-fights-traditional-images-of.html>
- ⁹⁸ Ensign C, Jones P. Gender-inclusive work with victims and their children in a coed shelter. In Hamel J and Nichols TL (eds.). *Family Interventions in Domestic Violence: A Handbook of Gender-Inclusive Theory and Treatment*. New York: Spring Publishing Co., 2007.
- ⁹⁹ Howard LW. Shelter an oasis for both sexes. Antelope Valley Press, January 22, 2006. <http://www.ncfmla.org/antelope-valley-press-012206.html>
- ¹⁰⁰ Declaration of Patricia Shanley-Overberg. November 1, 2002. www.ncfmla.org/pdf/overberg.pdf
- ¹⁰¹ South Lake Tahoe Women’s Center. Domestic violence against men. Accessed January 21, 2009. <http://www.sltwc.org/dvandmen.htm>
- ¹⁰² WTOL. Domestic abuse shelter for men opens in Fostoria. April 2, 2008. <http://www.wtol.com/Global/story.asp?s=8104714>
- ¹⁰³ The Caring Place: Male victim services. Accessed January 9, 2009. <http://www.thecaringplacenwi.org/MaleServices.htm>
- ¹⁰⁴ DASH, Inc.–Domestic Abuse Shelter Homes. <http://findsarasota.com/Listing.asp?id=852>
- ¹⁰⁵ Johnnie’s House. Accessed July 1, 2010. <http://www.johnnieshouse.com/index.htm>
- ¹⁰⁶ Women’s Rape and Crisis Center, Accessed July 1, 2010. <http://www.stoprapevermont.org/statistics/2008.html>
- ¹⁰⁷ National Family Violence Legislative Resource Center. Model programs and legislation: Victim services. <http://www.nfvllrc.org/ModelProgramsLegislation/VictimServices.htm>
- ¹⁰⁸ New Hampshire Coalition against Domestic and Sexual Violence. Violence Against Men in New Hampshire. No date. <http://www.nhcadsv.org/Maureen/VAM%20Report%20Final.pdf>
- ¹⁰⁹ Stop Abusive and Violent Environments. Shelter 990 analysis. Unpublished report based on shelters’ most recent 990 tax information provided to the Internal Revenue Service. January 16, 2009.
- ¹¹⁰ IRS 990 forms for 2006, available at www.guidestar.com.
- ¹¹¹ Florida Coalition Against Domestic Violence. Domestic violence monthly statistical report (ALICE). <http://www.fcadv.org/downloads/quality/Exhibit%20D%20Alice%20Report.doc>
- ¹¹² Additional agreements and forms can be found on the website of the Florida Coalition Against Domestic Violence. Contract/agreement exhibits FY 08/09. http://www.fcadv.org/quality-contract_fy.php#under25
- ¹¹³ FCADV Legal Clearinghouse Project. Claim request invoice. <http://www.fcadv.org/downloads/quality/Exhibit%20C%20LCH%20Claim%20Request%20Invoice.doc>
- ¹¹⁴ Florida Coalition Against Domestic Violence. Unit of service payment chart: July 1, 2008 – June 30, 2009. <http://www.fcadv.org/downloads/quality/Exhibit%20B%20Payment%20Chart.pdf>